CARLSMITH BALL LLP

IAN L. SANDISON 5597 TIM LUI-KWAN 2271 JOHN P. MANAUT 3989 ASB Tower, Suite 2100 1001 Bishop Street Honolulu, HI 96813 Tel No. 808.523.2500 Fax No. 808.523.0842

Attorneys for Applicant UNIVERSITY OF HAWAI'I AT HILO

RECEIVED
OFFICE OF CONSERVATION
AND COASTAL LANDS

2016 AUG 11 A 11: 22

DEPT. OF LAND & NATURAL RESOURCES STATE OF HAWAII

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

STATE OF HAWAI'I

IN THE MATTER OF

Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Application (CDUA) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Ka'ohe Mauka, Hāmakua, Hawai'i, TMK (3) 4-4-015:009 CASE NO. BLNR-CC-16-002

THE UNIVERSITY OF HAWAI'I AT HILO'S OBJECTIONS TO J.
LEINA'ALA SLEIGHTHOLM'S
JOINDER TO MEHANA KIHOI'S
MOTION TO EXCLUDE PUEO AS A
PARTY, FILED AUGUST 10, 2016
[DOC. 192]; CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

THE UNIVERSITY OF HAWAI'I AT HILO'S OBJECTIONS TO J. LEINA'ALA SLEIGHTHOLM'S JOINDER TO MEHANA KIHOI'S MOTION TO EXCLUDE PUEO AS A PARTY, FILED AUGUST 10, 2016 [DOC. 192]

The University of Hawai'i at Hilo ("University") submits its Objections to J. Leina'ala Sleightholm's Joinder to Mehana Kihoi's Motion to Exclude PUEO as a Party, filed August 10, 2016 [Doc. 192] ("Joinder"). The University objects to the Joinder because (1) it is untimely; and (2) the motion it purports to join has already been denied and therefore has already been ruled upon.

As discussed in the University's Opposition to Temple of Lono's Motion to File Motion

Out of Time [Doc. 179], filed August 10, 2016 [Doc. 194], and the University's Objections to (1)

Harry Fergerstrom's Opposition to Pueo's Motion to Set the Issues, filed August 9, 2016 [Doc.

186]; (2) J. Leina 'ala Sleightholm's Joinder to Hank Fergustrom's [sic] Motion to Oppose PUEO's Motion to Set Issues, filed August 10, 2016 [Doc. __]; and (3) Mehana Kihoi's Joinder to Hank Fergerstrom's Motion to Oppose P.U.E.O. LLC's Motion to Set the Issues, filed August 10, 2016 [Doc. 195], filed August 11, 2016, which are incorporated herein by reference, the deadline to file all motions in the above-captioned matter was July 18, 2016. Minute Order No. 13 [Doc. 115]. The deadline to file responses to the motions filed on July 18, 2016 was August 1, 2016. Id. The Joinder was filed nine days late.

Furthermore, the Hearing Officer did not grant any parties leave to file additional responses to Perpetuating Unique Educational Opportunities' ("PUEO") Motion to Set the Issues, filed July 18, 2016 [Doc. 99]. So the Joinder should be dismissed as untimely and unauthorized.

Moreover, at the pre-hearing conference on August 5, 2016, the Hearing Officer denied Mehana Kihoi's Motion to Deny the Intervention of Perpetuating Unique Educational Opportunities' as a Party in the Contested Case Hearing, filed July 18, 2016 [Doc. 98]. Therefore, there is no existing open motion for Ms. Sleightholm to join.

If the Hearing Officer decides to hear the Joinder on the merits, even though the underlying motion has already been denied, the University reserves the right to file a response at a later date. To the extent that the Joinder addresses issues about PUEO's admission as a party in this contested case, the University has briefed such issues in its Substantive Joinder in Support of Perpetuating Unique Education Opportunities' Motion to Set the Issues Filed July 18, 2016 [Doc. 997, filed August 1, 2016 [Doc. 140], at 9-11, and incorporates that brief by reference.

DATED: Honolulu, Hawai; August 11, 2016.

TIM LUI-KWAN JOHN P. MANAUT

Attorneys for Applicant UNIVERSITY OF HAWAI'I AT HILO

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

STATE OF HAWAI'I

IN THE MATTER OF

Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Application (CDUA) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Ka'ohe Mauka, Hāmakua, Hawai'i, TMK (3) 4-4-015:009 Case No. BLNR-CC-16-002

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned certifies that the above-referenced document was served upon the

following parties by email unless indicated otherwise:

JUDGE RIKI MAY AMANO (Ret.) rma3cc@yahoo.com Hearing Officer

DAVE M. LOUIE, ESQ.
CLIFFORD K. HIGA, ESQ.
NICHOLAS R. MONLUX, ESQ.
Kobayashi Sugita & Goda, LLP
dml@ksglaw.com
ckh@ksglaw.com
nrm@ksglaw.com
Special Deputy Attorneys General for
ATTORNEY GENERAL DOUGLAS S. CHIN,
THE DEPARTMENT OF THE ATTORNEY
GENERAL, and DEPUTY ATTORNEYS
GENERAL IN THEIR CAPACITY AS
COUNSEL FOR THE BOARD OF LAND AND
NATURAL RESOURCES and HEARING
OFFICER

MICHAEL CAIN
Office of Conservation and Coastal Lands
1151 Punchbowl Street, Room 131
Honolulu, HI 96813
michael.cain@hawaii.gov
Custodian of the Records
(original + digital copy)

JULIE H. CHINA, ESQ., Deputy Attorney General julie.h.china@hawaii.gov
WILLIAM J. WYNHOFF, ESQ., Deputy Attorney General bill.j.wynhoff@hawaii.gov
Counsel for the BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

J. DOUGLAS ING, ESQ.
douging@wik.com
ROSS T. SHINYAMA, ESQ.
rshinyama@wik.com
Watanabe Ing LLP
Counsel for TMT INTERNATIONAL
OBSERVATORY, LLC

LINCOLN S.T. ASHIDA, ESQ.

lsa@torkildson.com

NEWTON J. CHU, ESQ.
njc@torkildson.com

Torkildson, Katz, Moore, Hetherington & Harris

Counsel for PERPETUATING UNIQUE

EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITIES (PUEO)

RICHARD NAIWIEHA WURDEMAN, ESQ. mwurdeman@rnwlaw.com
Counsel for Petitioners MAUNA KEA ANAINA
HOU; CLARENCE KUKAUAKAHI CHING;
FLORES-CASE OHANA; DEBORAH J.
WARD; PAUL K. NEVES; and KAHEA: THE
HAWAIIAN ENVIRONMENTAL ALLIANCE

DWIGHT J. VICENTE 2608 Ainaola Drive Hilo, HI 96720-3538 (no email; mailing address only)

RICHARD L. DELEON kekaukike@msn.com

hanahanai@hawaii.rr.com

CINDY FREITAS

JOSEPH KUALII LINDSEY CAMARA kualiic@hotmail.com

HARRY FERGERSTROM P.O. Box 951 Kurtistown, HI 96750 hankhawaiian@yahoo.com (via email & U.S. mail)

WILLIAM FREITAS

C. M. KAHOʻOKAHI KANUHA
pohaku7@yahoo.com

kahookahi@gmail.com

TIFFNIE KAKALIA tiffniekakalia@gmail.com

BRANNON KAMAHANA KEALOHA brannonk@hawaii.edu

GLEN KILA makakila@gmail.com

JENNIFER LEINA'ALA SLEIGHTHOLM leina.ala.s808@gmail.com

LANNY ALAN SINKIN
lanny.sinkin@gmail.com
Representative for the Temple of Lono

kahookahi@gmail.com

KALIKOLEHUA KANAELE
akulele@yahoo.com

uhiwai@live.com

MAELANI LEE

maelanilee@yahoo.com

MEHANA KIHOI

STEPHANIE-MALIA:TABBADA s.tabbada@hawaiiantel.net

HARVEY E. HENDERSON, JR., ESQ., Deputy Attorney General harvey.e.hendersonjr@hawaii.gov
Counsel for the Honorable DAVID Y. IGE, and BLNR Members SUZANNE CASE and STANLEY ROEHRIG

DATED: Honolulu, Hawai'i, August 11, 2016.

IAN L. SANDISON TIM LUI-KWAN

JOHN P. MANAUT

Attorneys for Applicant UNIVERSITY OF HAWAI'I AT HILO